

1 GLANCY PRONGAY & MURRAY LLP

2 Lionel Z. Glancy (#134180)

3 Marc L. Godino (#182689)

4 Mark S. Greenstone (#199606)

5 1925 Century Park East, Suite 2100

6 Los Angeles, California 90067

7 Telephone: (310) 201-9150

8 Facsimile: (310) 201-9160

9 E-mail: info@glancylaw.com

10 *Attorneys for Plaintiffs*

11 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

12 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

13 JULIA RENIGER, GREG BATTAGLIA,  
14 LUCIA SAITTA and ANN MANCUSO,  
15 Individually and On Behalf of All Others  
16 Similarly Situated,

17 Plaintiffs,

18 v.

19 HYUNDAI MOTOR AMERICA, a  
20 California corporation, and HYUNDAI  
21 MOTOR COMPANY, a foreign  
22 corporation,

23 Defendants.

Case No. 4:14-cv-03612-CW

Hon. Claudia Wilken

**ORDER GRANTING PLAINTIFF'S  
MOTION FOR AWARD OF ATTORNEYS'  
FEES, COSTS, EXPENSES, AND SERVICE  
AWARDS TO CLASS  
REPRESENTATIVES**

1 The Court, having reviewed Julia Reniger, Greg Battaglia, Lucia Saitta and Ann  
2 Mancuso's ("Plaintiffs") Motion for Award of Attorneys' Fees, Costs, Expenses, and Service  
3 Awards to Class Representatives, the pleadings and other papers on file in this action, and the  
4 statements of counsel and the parties, hereby finds that Plaintiffs' motion is GRANTED.

5 NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT:  
6

7 1. The Court, for purposes of this Order, adopts the terms and definitions set forth  
8 in the Class Action Settlement Agreement filed with this Court on June 21, 2016 ("Settlement  
9 Agreement") [ECF #72].

10 2. The Court finds that Class Counsel, Glancy Prongay & Murray LLP ("GPM"),  
11 incurred \$33,661.73 in reasonable costs and expenses in prosecuting this litigation as of the  
12 date they filed their Motion for Award of Attorneys' Fees, Costs, Expenses, and Service  
13 Awards to Class Representatives. The Court finds that these costs and expenses were  
14 reasonably incurred in the ordinary course of prosecuting this case and were necessary given  
15 the complex nature and scope of the case. Accordingly, the Court approves a payment to  
16 GPM in the amount of their total costs and expenses incurred to reimburse them for such costs  
17 and expenses.  
18

19 3. The Court has confirmed the reasonableness of Plaintiffs' fee request by  
20 conducting a lodestar cross-check. The Court finds that Plaintiffs' reasonable lodestar as of  
21 the date they filed their Motion for Award of Attorneys' Fees, Costs, Expenses, and Service  
22 Awards to Class Representatives was \$736,225.25. Accordingly, Plaintiff's requested fee  
23 award of \$711,338.27 (\$745,000 minus \$33,661.73 in expenses) represents a negative  
24 multiplier of 0.96 based on GPM's current hourly rates. This multiplier is within the range of  
25 multipliers awarded in similar complex, class action cases and is well-justified here, given the  
26  
27  
28

~~[PROPOSED]~~ ORDER GRANTING PLAINTIFF'S MOTION FOR ATTORNEYS' FEES, COSTS, AND  
INCENTIVE AWARD

Case No. 4:14-cv-03612-CW

1 novelty and difficulty of this litigation, counsel's skillful handling of the difficult factual and  
2 legal issues presented, the significant contingent risks in this case, and the quality of the result  
3 achieved.

4 4. The Court further approves an incentive award of \$2,500 to each of the five  
5 class representatives. The incentive award is justified by: (1) the risk to the class  
6 representative in commencing suit, both financial and otherwise; (2) the amount of time and  
7 effort spent by the class representative in this case; and (3) the duration of the litigation.  
8

9 5. The attorneys' fees, costs and incentive awards set forth in this Order shall be  
10 paid by Defendants in accordance with the terms of the Settlement Agreement.  
11

12 **IT IS SO ORDERED.**

13  
14 Dated: March 28, 2017

15   
16 THE HONORABLE CLAUDIA ANN WILKEN  
17 UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

~~PROPOSED~~ ORDER GRANTING PLAINTIFF'S MOTION FOR ATTORNEYS' FEES, COSTS, AND  
INCENTIVE AWARD

Case No. 4:14-cv-03612-CW

**Exhibit A – List of Persons Who Requested Exclusion**

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

~~PROPOSED~~ ORDER GRANTING PLAINTIFF'S MOTION FOR ATTORNEYS' FEES, COSTS, AND  
INCENTIVE AWARD

Case No. 4:14-cv-03612-CW